

# California Public Utilities Commission Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan

#### **STATUS REPORT MAY 2020**

# About the Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan

The California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) adopted the Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan (ESJ Action Plan) in February 2019. The ESJ Action Plan outlines a comprehensive mission and operating framework with which the CPUC should address ESJ issues, consisting of nine overarching goals and 95 concrete action items to advance each of the goals. The goals include:

- 1. Consistently integrate equity and access considerations throughout CPUC proceedings and other efforts.
- 2. Increase investment in clean energy resources to benefit ESJ communities, especially to improve local air quality and public health.
- 3. Strive to improve access to high-quality water, communications, and transportation services for ESJ communities.
- 4. Increase climate resiliency in ESJ communities.
- 5. Enhance outreach and public participation opportunities for ESJ communities to meaningfully participate in the CPUC's decision-making process and benefit from CPUC programs.
- 6. Enhance enforcement to ensure safety and consumer protection for ESJ communities.
- 7. Promote economic and workforce development opportunities in ESJ communities.
- 8. Improve training and staff development related to ESJ issues within the CPUC's jurisdiction.
- 9. Monitor the CPUC's ESJ efforts to evaluate how they are achieving their objectives.

The ESJ Action Plan also establishes a designation of "Environmental and Social Justice (ESJ) Communities" for the purposes of CPUC policy and programs, consisting of communities that are:

- Predominantly people of color or low-income;
- Underrepresented in the policy setting or decision-making process;
- Subject to a disproportionate impact from one or more environmental hazards; and
- Likely to experience disparate implementation of environmental regulations and socioeconomic investments.

Targeted communities typically include but are not limited to:

- Disadvantaged Communities, located in the most environmentally and socioeconomically impacted
  California census tracts, as determined by the 25 percent highest scores (75th percentile) when using Cal
  EPA's CalEnviroScreen tool;
- All Native/Indigenous peoples living on Tribal lands;
- Low-income households (household incomes below 80 percent of the area median income); and
- Low-income census tracts (census tracts where aggregated household incomes are less than 80 percent of area or state median income).

# Implementation Structure

In order to ensure proper compliance with the actions outlines in the ESJ Action Plan, the CPUC has created an implementation structure to ensure effective coordination and sharing of lessons learned across the agency. Staff from the News and Outreach Office (NOO) in the Executive Division serves as the primary staff lead, with the ability to work across the CPUC to communicate with staff and leadership. NOO Staff is supported by advisory staff from Commissioner offices. Together, these individuals make up the "Core Team" implementing the ESJ Action Plan and work together on coordination and strategic planning.

For the purposes of coordination and communication, the Core Team has established "ESJ Liaisons" in each Division across the CPUC. These ESJ Liaisons are tasked with providing status updates on action items listed in the ESJ Plan and participating in an ESJ Working Group. The ESJ Working Group is focused on promoting the goals of the plan across the CPUC and to increase capacity and knowledge on how to address ESJ issues.

Table 1: CPUC ESJ Liaisons by Division

	1
Communications Division	Wylen Lai;
	Charlotte Taylor
Energy Division	Kathleen Yip;
	Amy Mesrobian
Water Division	Steve St. Marie
Administrative Law Judge Division (ALJ)	Anthony Colbert
Legal Division	Jack Mulligan
Office of the Commission	Saul Gomez
News & Outreach Office (NOO)	Monica Palmeira
Rail Safety Division	David Leggett
Consumer Protection and Enforcement Division (CPED)	Syche Cai
Wildfire Safety Division	Ceallach Vigil
Safety and Enforcement Division (SED)	Karen Shea
Human Resources (HR)	Jared Eakins
Utility Audits, Risk & Compliance	Kevin Nakamura
Core Team	Monica Palmeira
	Nicole Cropper
	Yuliya Schmidt
	Sarah Sharpe

## Status of Implementation of ESJ Action Plan

In the Appendix to this Status Report is a matrix which compiles status updates on each of the 95 discrete actions in the ESJ Action Plan. Overall, there has been progress on almost every action item listed in the plan. Most of the action items fell under the responsibility of the Energy Division, followed by the News & Outreach Office, Consumer Protection and Enforcement Division, and Communications Division. Taken together, these status updates represent meaningful accomplishments towards better serving ESJ communities with new pilot programs and services, policies intended to curb environmental impacts, and opportunities to participate CPUC decision-making.

# Highlights

- Incorporating ESJ Impacts into Decisions and Resolutions Actions 1.1 and 1.2 task the CPUC with incorporating ESJ issues and impacts into decision making. The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) Division is the lead on completing these action items. The Division has identified two categories of proceedings with which to pilot strategies for furthering this action the California Alternative Rates for Energy and Energy Savings Program (CARE/ESA) Proceeding and a rail crossing proceeding yet to be identified. For these pilots, ALJ Division will work with the ESJ Core Team and assigned Commissioner's offices to create guidance for ALJs to follow when considering ESJ impacts. While Scoping Memos are ultimately issued by the assigned Commissioner's offices, these considerations will be incorporated into the memos, such that they can identify issues from the start of the proceeding process. Additionally, the aim is to include an "ESJ Impact" section in Decisions and Resolutions similar to how "Safety Considerations" are currently presented. Steps forward on these action items will continue throughout 2020.
- Increasing Participation of ESJ Stakeholders in CPUC Processes Several action items task the News and Outreach Office (NOO) primarily with facilitating access of ESJ communities to CPUC processes and decision makers. Steps taken towards implementing this goal include creating a new public comment feature on the docket card, coordinating relevant tours and stakeholder meetings to coincide with Offsite Voting Meetings, pushing out regional stakeholder newsletters, and increasing the focus on ESJ issues writ large. NOO is also working on increasing outreach to community-based organizations that have not historically participated in CPUC activities. NOO intends to continue building on this progress by revising collateral materials with a focus on accessibility, and by improving workshops and hearings at the CPUC.
- Key Proceedings Further ESJ Priorities In addition to a number of other proceedings identified in the ESJ Action Plan, some key proceedings have made critical steps forward that are of particular relevance to ESJ communities. As a product of the Affordability proceeding (R.18-07-006), staff will begin testing affordability metrics, the first of their kind in the nation, in rate cases later this year. Additionally, the Climate Adaptation proceeding (R.18-04-019) will adopt a definition of vulnerable communities to be utilized by utilities in their planning for climate change impacts. Also, in the Wildfire Mitigation Planning proceeding (R. 18-10-007), new, enhanced requirements were added related to in-language outreach before, during, and after a wildfire to communities with Limited English Proficiency, setting an important precedent for other proceedings related to outreach and protocols for wildfire and other disasters. Across several proceedings, from electric-vehicle charging to battery-storage technology, more and more funds are being prioritized for Disadvantaged and low-income communities.
- <u>Training and Staff Development</u> A priority for the ESJ Working Group is to promote opportunities for staff to learn more about issues and tools to address ESJ issues in their work. Several ESJ Liaisons participated in a community outreach and engagement training hosted by a partnership of state agencies, with plans to adapt this training for a CPUC-specific audience. CPUC staff played a leadership role in creating this training and served as one of the organizers and facilitators. Additionally, future training opportunities may include instruction on tools like CalEnviroScreen as well as skill-building opportunities related to meeting facilitation and implicit bias.

# **Timeline & Next Steps**

Moving forward, the ESJ Working Group will continue to meet to share lessons learned and common priorities for furthering ESJ work across the CPUC. The individual ESJ Liaisons will also continue to monitor progress on the implementation of their respective divisions' action items.

Metrics and evaluation will be an area of particular focus. Individual programs and initiatives at the CPUC have specific systems for tracking and reporting program outcomes. A future exercise should include conducting a more thorough analysis of these metrics across the agency to understand the agency's overall impact. Efforts may also include encouraging more robust tracking of program outcomes and metrics to ensure ESJ communities are benefitting from CPUC initiatives and aggregating data across the CPUC.

Additionally, the ESJ Action Plan is due for an update in February 2021. While this update will likely not revise the core tenets of the ESJ Action Plan (i.e. the nine goals), the aim of the update will be to offer revised action items to ensure ESJ considerations are continuing to be pursued across the CPUC. Now with established ESJ Liaisons from each division, the Core Team will work closely with each division to create meaningful action items for the next iteration of the plan that continue to push the goals and intentions of the ESJ Action Plan and encourage forward progress on these issues.

When conducting this update, the Core Team and ESJ Liaisons will consult with existing advisory bodies at the CPUC, including the Low Income Oversight Board (LIOB) and the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG), as well as additional ESJ stakeholders throughout the state to ensure a robust package and plan to meet the needs of ESJ communities in the years to come.

Action #	Action Item	Lead Division	2018 Status (from ESJ Plan)	2018 Next Steps (from ESJ Plan)	2019 Status	2019 Status Update	Next Steps
Goal 1: Con	sistently integrate equity and	access considerat	tions throughout CPU	proceedings and other effort	orts.		
1.1	Develop a standard checklist to identify ESJ issues in proceeding or regulatory activity to appropriately create the scope of the proceeding or activity	ALI Division	New Proposal	Create Task Force by 3/2019; Checklist by 6/2019	In progress	ALJ Division will pilot addressing ESJ impacts in two proceedings - CARE/ESA and a Rail Crossing application. Language has been incorporated into CARE/ESA Scoping Memo.	Will determine an appropriate Rail Crossing application for pilot. Will use these pilots to develop guidelines for ALIs to follow when scoping proceedings. Aim to complete by end of 2020.
1.2	For decisions, resolutions, and advice letters that impact customers, residents, or small businesses in ESJ communities, include a section on ESJ impacts where appropriate	A⊔ Division	New Proposal	Based on outcome of Action 1.1, develop instructions for applying checklist to proceedings and regulatory activities by 8/2019	Pending	Intend to incorporate ESJ impacts into Scoping Memos so issues are addressed throughout proceeding and incorporated appropriately into decisions.	Will meet with division leads for advice letter and resolution templates to begin discussions of how to incorporate into templates.
1.3	Launch online comment system for each proceeding, available to any member of the public	News & Outreach Office	Early stages of staff design	Create testing prototype by 8/2019.	Complete	Online comment system was launched in early 2020, allowing the public to submit comments directly on the Docket Card and review other comments. Public rollout was also completed with a Media Advisory, webpage, and continuous social media posts.	Continue to publicize, especially in Customer Notices/Bill Inserts. Will seek additional opportunities to promote.
1.4	Leverage partnerships with other state agencies, such as CARB, to engage with DACs	News & Outreach Office	Initiated	Ongoing development	In progress	Continue to work with CEC to convene Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group. NOO BCO staff attends monthly California Climate Investments outreach meetings convened by CARB. NOO BCO staff also attending local CARB AB 617 meetings and highlighting opportunities for collaboration with CPUC.	Partnership work continuing to grow, including participating in inter-agency grant review committees with Strategic Growth Council.
1.5	Identify appropriate CBOs and develop a system to assist in generating public awareness about proceedings in early stages	News & Outreach Office	Initial list of CBOs developed	Projected initial list of CBOs by 6/2019. Continue to update on regular basis.	In progress	NOO BCO convenes weekly to look at new filings and determine which may be of interest to CBOs. NOO BCO then conduct proactive outreach to involve CBOs in those proceedings. NOO BCO also has started sending out monthly newsletters with additional opportunities to be involved at the CPUC, as well as encouraging CBOs to subscribe to the CPUC newsletter which outlines all new filings.	Continue ongoing work. Pursue opportunities to streamline CBO email contact via Constant Contact.
1.6	Enhance public awareness of public comment opportunities through targeted outreach	News & Outreach Office			In progress	New Public Comment feature has been publicly launched. Most notable awareness building has been through revised Customer Notices for GRCs that are directemailed to customers by utilities.	Will pursue additional means to publicize amongst CBOs and other partners. Will also continue to promote via social media.
1.7	Make public comments more easily accessible to Commissioners and ALJs through a keyword or other efficient system	News & Outreach Office			Complete	New Public Comment feature is available directly on the Docket Card, where anyone can scroll and review comments.	Will pursue a centralized mechanism for housing all Public Comments across Public Advisor Office submissions and Docket Card.
1.8	Add 2 positions to serve as liaisons to ALI and other divisions to develop and deliver plain language content for the public to describe the technical and legal issues in decisions, resolutions and other relevant documents	News & Outreach Office			Complete	Positions have been added and hired. Work has included revising and improving accessibility of Customer Notices, preparing Media Advisories, and reviewing Fact Sheets.	Consider additional opportunities for NOO to partner with industry division staff to produce plain language content, including proceeding-based Fact Sheets.
1.9	Translate information on active proceedings (such as plain language summaries)	News & Outreach Office			In progress	Fact Sheets and Customer Notices being prepared for PPHs are being written in plain language and include more streamlined content.	Consider creating proceeding-based Fact Sheets for all open proceedings.

Goal 2: Increase investment in clean energy resources to benefit ESJ communities, especially to improve local air quality and public health.

2.1	Provide information about planned energy generation resources, forecasted air emissions, the DACs they serve, and how they plan to minimize air pollutants in DACs	Energy Division	Plans submitted to CPUC 8/2018	CPUC review of plans. Plans submitted every two years.	Ongoing	(16 CCAs and 3 ESPs) did not meet the criteria pollutant reporting requirements, and CPUC directed them to resubmit this portion of their plans (Decision 19-04-040). Also as part of the 2019-20 cycle, staff calculated SO2, NOx, and PM2.5 for the proposed Reference System Plan and separated the results by DAC and non-DAC	The CPUC requires 2020 LSE filings of their Preferred Portfolio to estimate the NO PM2.5, and SO2 emissions associated with their Preferred Portfolio and report these results. Also, LSEs must describe and provide quantitative evidence to support how the LSE's Preferred Portfolio minimizes local air pollutants with early priority on DACs they serve. LSEs must specify what current and planned LSE activities/programs, if any, address DACs, and describe how the LSE's actions and
	,					areas. The result shows that 33% of 2030 statewide NOx, 30% of statewide PM 2.5, and 23% of statewide SO2 occur in DACs, which contain 25% of California's population.	engagement have changed over time.
2.2	Undertake research to better understand the lifecycle GHG and other local pollutant emissions of energy generation resources, particularly the local impacts of bioenergy plants in DACs and low-income areas	Energy Division	Initial intern research commenced 6/2018	Ongoing	In progress	developing a tool that can evaluate lifecycle GHG emissions and potentially account	Staff is seeking to refine the tool by coordinating with CARB staff and other stakeholders working on similar lifecycle evaluations. (no schedule set/no proceeding)
2.3	Optimize California's electric resource mix across GHG, cost, and reliability using the IRP process to effectively inform the CPUC's infrastructure and procurement decision, with early priority on reducing pollutants in disadvantaged communities; the IRP's ongoing analysis will examine the impact of different GHG emissions reduction scenarios on air pollution emissions in disadvantaged communities.	Energy Division	Approved in D.18- 02018	Reviewing Plans received by CPUC in 8/2018; Subsequent plans will be submitted for 2021-2022 cycle of IRP	In progress	The CPUC proposes that the RSP be used in statewide planning. This portfolio has been evaluated in terms of air pollutants and other greenhouse gas emissions counting 502, NOx, and PM2.5 and the result has been separated by DAC and non-DAC areas. In this process, the emissions by ARB basin have been calculated for more locational granularity and where it was available, plant-specific criteria pollutant emissions factors been used. This analysis showed that "The most efficient way to reduce criteria pollutants is likely by installing emissions control technologies on biogas and biomass resources. The CPUC should prioritize reducing emissions from these resources, especially in DACs" (2019- 20 IRP: Proposed Reference System Portfolio Validation with SERVM Reliability and Production Cost Modeling; Nov 6, 2019)	In the second year of the cycle (2020), the LSEs will file their individual IRPs and t staff will evaluate these plans individually and in aggregation. Staff will review th amount criterial pollutants based on the LSEs' resource portfolios.
2.4	To increase customer participation, identify and report all Green tariff Shared Renewables projected developed in DACs, but have not been counted as EJ projects because they exceed the 1 MW limit.	Energy Division	Data requested and received from utilities	Integrate data onto current RPS database to improve understanding of project locations	In progress	"Pursuant to PU Code Section 2833 (d)(1)(a), GTSR EJ projects may be sited in the 20% most impacted communities in each IOU territory, as designated by Cal EnviroScreen, but shall not exceed 1 MW in Capacity. The CPUC incents these projects by allowing for a higher price threshold within the competitive RAM solicitation process. Through Resolution in 2019, Energy Division identified and reported on all GTSR projects developed in DACs but have not been counted as EJ projects because they exceed the 1 MW limit, with a recommendation to the legislature for a modification to the 1 MW cap to incentivize more projects in DACS."	Continue implementation of GTSR program. Support any potential legislative solutions.

2.5	Note available level of transmission capacity to support transition to zero carbon energy resources from fossil fuels, especially in ESJ communities	Energy Division	Transmission capacity for renewables is examined every cycle of IRP and the results are submitted to the California Independent System Operator (CAISO) for its Transmission Planning Process. IRP analyzes the need for existing thermal generation fossil fleet under different GHG targets and the associated air pollutant and DAC implications.	Submittal of the 2018 IRP resource portfolios to the 2019 CAISO Transmission Planning Process. 2019 IRP will analyze, in coordination with the CAISO, the need for existing system thermal generation under different GHG targets. Analysis will assess the impact on transmission, air pollutants, and DACs to the extent allowed by available data and current model functionality.		"Transmission capacity for renewables is examined every cycle of IRP and the results are submitted to the California Independent System Operator (CAISO) for its Transmission Planning Process. 2019-20 IRP analyzes the need for existing thermal generation fossil fleet under different GHG targets and the associated air pollutant implications. 2019-20 IRP analyzes, in coordination with the CAISO, the need for existing system thermal generation under different GHG targets, and now includes the modeling functionality to decide which parts of the gas fleet to economically retain for CAISO ratepayers. The impact on transmission, air pollutants, and DACs to the extent allowed by available data and current model functionality have been included in the analysis."	" In early 2020 the 2019 IRP RSP will be passed to CAISO for study in its TPP process to analyze transmission implications of the portfolio. LSE IRPs filed later in 2020 will also be aggregated into a Preferred System Portfolio, likely to be passed to CAISO TPP in early 2021 for similar analysis."
2.6	Deploy charging infrastructure for ESJ communities to use zero- emission cars to meet their transportation needs.	Energy Division	Approved in D.16- 01045, D.16-01-023, D.16-12-065, D.18-01- 024, D.18-05-040, and D.18-09-034; and in Settlement Agreement with NRG Energy	Commission currently overseeing SCE, SDG&E, PG&E, and NRG Energy deployments of charging infrastructure. In 2019, utilities will continue implementing existing infrastructure programs and develop a joint proposal to improve and align rates to facilitate EV charging at prices competitive with conventional fuels	In progress	Commission continues to oversee SCE, SDG&E, and PG&E deployments of light-duty charging infrastructure. The NRG Settlement deployments of charging infrastructure are complete, and currently being audited. In early 2020, Energy Division staff will release a staff report to provide wholistic planning guidance to the IOUs.	Following the release of the Energy Division staff proposal, or Transportation Electrification Framework (TEF), there will be several workshops and stakeholder comments before the TEF is adopted.
2.7	Develop rates that will encourage commercial customers in ESJ communities to electrify transportation and reduce pollutants	Energy Division	Approved in D.18-05- 040, D.18-09-034	New SCE rates deployment expected to commence in early 2019. PG&E commercial rate proposal expected in November 2018.	In progress	PG&E's rate has been approved, and they are beginning implementation in 2020. SDG&E in 2019 also submitted a proposal for a new EV commercial rate.	PG&E will be implementing their rate and the proceeding for SDG&E's rate will move forward.
2.8	Deploy charging infrastructure for ESJ communities to access public transportation, ride sharing, or other forms of zero emission transportation	Energy Division	Approved in D.18- 01024, D.18-05-040, D.18-09-034	Infrastructure construction expected initiation in 2019 in PG&E, SCE, and Liberty Utilities' California service territory. SDG&E proposal under review with decision expected in late Q1 or early Q2 2019.	In progress	Commission is overseeing programs at PG&E, SCE, SDG&E (D.19-08-026), and Liberty Utilities to deploy infrastructure to support medium- and heavy-duty EV charging infrastructure, including focus on electrifying transit and school buses. The NRG Settlement, which has completed deployment of infrastructure, built out several sites to support car sharing for low-income or DAC communities.	The IOUs will ramp up (or begin) implementation of their medium- and heavy-duty programs in 2020.

2.9	Identify transportation sectors in which ratepayer-funded electrification will most efficiently provide benefits to DACs	Energy Division		Medium-duty and heavy-duty infrastructure pilots launch in 2018; program evaluation expected in 2019. Data regarding impacts to DACs is collected and valuated. Evaluations inform future investments. Learnings from pilots to inform implementation of larger programs authorized in D.18-05-040 and in the approval of SDG&E's program proposed in A.18-01-012.	In progress	Program evaluations expected in 2020.	IOUs are wrapping up pilots and program evaluations will come in 2020.
2.10	Explore options to encourage electrification of rail yards in ESJ communities	Energy Division	New Proposal	Initiate research to understand barriers	In progress	No railyards work to date.	No railyards work to date.
2.11	Incentivize rooftop solar projects for residential buildings in ESJ communities	Energy Division	Approved Solar on Multifamily affordable housing (SOMAH) Program with about \$90 million/year in D.17-12-022. DAC Single family Affordable Solar Homes (DAC-SASH) program with an annual budget of \$10 million in D.18-06-027	SOMAH Program Administrator chosen and program manual developed. Incentives likely available by 3/2019. Third party program administrator to be selected for DAC-SASH.		"On July 1, 2019 the SOMAH Program officially launched and began accepting applications for incentives. On that same day, the SOMAH program surpassed targets and received more than 255 applications to install over 74 MW of capacity. In 2019, \$99.3M in SOMAH incentives were set-aside for 118 active applications. These PV projects are geographically dispersed across California and encompass nearly 12,000 tenant units. Nearly 93% of solar credits generated by these incentives are projected to directly offset tenant usage at these low-income properties. The SOMAH Program's funding is currently being replenished for 2020 and in late December 2019, the CPUC issued a ruling seeking comments on the program's extension until 2026. GRID Alternatives selected to be the third party program administrator of DAC-SASH. DAC-SASH was officially launched on September 12, 2019. As of the end of 2019, over 600 kW of capacity had been interconnected on the homes of eligible DAC-SASH participants."	"The SOMAH Program's funding is currently being replenished for 2020 and in late December 2019, the CPUC issued a ruling seeking comments on the program's extension until 2026. DAC-SASH customer recruitment is continuing on schedule."
2.12	Incentivize solar alternatives for customers who cannot participate in rooftop programs	Energy Division	DAC-Green Tariff program will provide a 20 percent utility bill discount to low-income customers, and Community Solar Green Tariff will provide a 20 percent bill discount primarily to low-income customers located in or near their communities — Both approved in D.18-06-027	Anticipated program launch by 12/2019.	In progress	The IOUs implementation plans were approved by CPUC on May 30, 2019. The IOUs' DAC-GT and CSGT project solicitation documents were approved by Energy Division in late December 2019. Given the 60 day deadline established in Resolution E-4999, the IOUs will launch Requests or Offers by early March to solicit eligible DAC-GT and CSGT projects. PG&E will open their DAC-GT program to customer enrollment in March 2020, using existing eligible capacity.	CCAs began submitting their program implementation plans via advice letter at the end of 2019. This will continue into 2020. ED will have to issue a resolution to approve the CCAs' Tier 3 advice letters for CCAs to launch their own DAC-GT/CSGT programs as authorized in D.18-06-027.

	T			1			
2.13	Implement AB 797, increasing available funds for solar water heating in ESJ communities.	Energy Division	Beginning in 1/2018 CSI Thermal Program allocated 50 percent of its incentive budget was available to low- income residential housing or buildings in DACs. Expanded program to include San Joaquin Valley homes.	Continue program implementation.	Complete	Continue program implementation through July 2020 when the CSI Thermal program closes. CSI Thermal programs sunsets on July 31, 2020.	N/A
2.14	Programmable Communicating Thermostat pilots for low income households ESA Program	Energy Division	Approved in D.16 - 11022	Anticipated pilot initiation by 1/2019.	Complete	Electric IOUs installed 134 Programmable Communicating Thermostats (PCT), submitted surveys, and currently have evaluation underway. SoCalGas has installed 884 PCTs and begun surveys (different schedule).	Meet periodically with IOUs on progress of pilot.
2.15	Energy Savings Assistance program will expand to include common areas of multifamily buildings	Energy Division	Approved in D.16- 11022	Expected measures available by 3/2019.	Complete	Common area measures are now available through ESA. These are measures installed outside of the units in multi-family buildings, specifically in common or shared spaces. Program is operational in all 4 Large IOU (PG&E, SCE, SCG, and SDG&E) territories. The IOUs have collectively completed 10 common area projects through December 2019	"IOUs will report normalized energy use of multifamily projects and savings in ESA Program annual reports per D.16-11-022. In total, the IOUs have prequalified/enrolled over 150 common area projects in multifamily buildings and will continue to implement common area measures throughout 2020."
2.16	The Energy Upgrade California program will continue to reach out to CBOs especially those that serve low-income, limited English and faith-based communities, including those in ESJ communities, to manage their energy use and participate in clean energy solutions in order to lower energy bills	Energy Division	D.16-03-029 directed a Joint Consumer Action Plan, completed in 3/2018	Maintain relationships with identified organizations by 1/2019.	Ongoing	D.16-03-029 directed a Joint Consumer Action Plan with a January workshop for stakeholder input. EUC program contractor works closely with CBOs on outreach and media.	Maintain relationships with identified organizations by 1/2020.
2.17	Self-Generation Incentive Program (SGIP) allocates 25 percent of its annual energy storage budget (about \$32.5 million) to state and local agencies, educational institutions, non-profits, and small businesses located in ESJs	Energy Division	Approved in D.17- 10004. Funds available 1/2018 Applications	Applications for funds are being accepted	Ongoing	D.19-09-027 increased the incentive levels for the SGIP equity budget to \$0.85/Wh. In addition, D.19-09-027 created the equity resiliency budget that enables customers who are eligible for the equity budget and who have critical resiliency needs (re PSPS events) to participate in a new budget category with an incentive of \$1.00/Wh. In early 2020, the CPUC adopted \$830 M in funding for SGIP for 2020-2024. 63% of the funding was allocated to the new equity resiliency budget.	
2.18	SDG&E and SCE propose to provide about \$12 million in incentives for customer energy storage jointly with SOMAH projects in DACs	Energy Division	D.17-12-005 required storage proposals by 3/2018	CPUC will consider utility proposals through 3/2019.	Complete	"CPUC D.19-06-032 approved PG&E's BTM program to comply with the 2016 Assembly Bill 2868 which sought to increase distributed generation (DG) in California. PG&E's approved BTM program is a smart water heater program that prioritizes customers in low-income communities with propane water heaters including communities in the San Joaquin Valley. PG&E is authorized to spend up to \$6.4 million from 2019-2025 for this program with a program cap of 5 MW."  D.19-06-032 rejected SDG&E and SCE's DG proposals because they were incomplete, did not comply with the objectives of AB 2868, and were too similar to the SGIP.	N/A

						,	
2.19	Implementation of \$2.5 million Demand Response pilots targeted to change energy use behavior in DACs	Energy Division	Pilot budget approved in D.17-12-003 as well as stakeholder process based on ACO straw proposal. D.18-11-029 set objectives and guidelines for pilot design based on straw proposal; called for advice letters	CPUC will consider pilot proposals for approval.	In progress	February 2019 IOUs filed advice letters with pilot plans. Energy Division approved them later in 2019, including after supplements	Start pilot implementation late 2019/early 2020
2.20	Create pilot projects for San Joaquin Valley residents (many of whom were previously unable to access natural gas) to test various alternatives for affordable clean energy, including fuel switching to all electric	Energy Division	Pilots and their budgets approved in D.18-12015	Public workshops by 2/2019. Execution of program, contracts, including: Community Energy Program Navigator, Program Manager by 7/2019. Pilot Process evaluation by 5/2019.	In progress	Pilot implementation plans were finalized. Contracts were executed for the entities responsible for community outreach and pilot administration. A bill protection mechanism for pilot participants was finalized.	Implement pilots in Q1/Q2 of 2020. A split incentives approach will be finalized. Continue to gather data to inform ongoing program.
2.21	Oversee utility Electric Program Investment Charge (EPIC) projects to support the development of clean energy technologies that benefit DACs	Energy Division	D.18-10-052 approved utilities' EPIC plans	Utilities file application with plan to better incorporate DAC input into investment planning process by 5/2019.	Ongoing	A PD released on 12/23/2019 deems the Joint IOU's engagement with DAC stakeholders adequate. The Joint IOUs conducted 7 outreach discussions with DAC groups to solicit feedback on the draft Joint Application in how to better incorporate DAC interests.	Staff will continue to oversee IOU engagement with DACs to better incorporate their input into the EPIC R&D program.
2.22	Oversee CEC's EPIC projects to support the development of clean energy technologies that benefit DACs and low-income customers	Energy Division	D.18-01-008 approved CEC's plan for 25 percent of technology demonstration and deployment projects located in DACs	Research projects anticipated to launch in 2019.	Ongoing	CEC is required by statute (AB 523) to spend 25% of EPIC Technology Demonstration and Deployment funds on projects located in and benefitting DACs as well as an additional 10% of funds on projects located in and benefitting low-income communities. As of December 31, 2019, total spending in DACs and low-income communities for Technology, Demonstration, and Deployment (TD&D) projects for EPIC I, II, and III was \$186,423,511.	Staff will continue to oversee CEC's R&D spending in low-income and disadvantaged communities.
nal 3· Str	ive to improve access to high-c	uuality water con	nmunications and trai	esportation services for FSL	ommunities		
3.1	Consider water affordability, pooling funds across water utilities for low-income service, and water district consolidation.	Water Division	Intend to issue decisions regarding (1) data sharing and (2) consistency of low-income programs R. 17-06-024	Data sharing decision by 12/2019; Low-Income program consistency decision		Decisions still to be developed	Decisions expected to be issued in 2020
3.2	Develop methods and processes to assess affordability across Commission proceedings and services (also 3.11)	Energy, Communications, and Water Divisions	Scoping Ruling issued 1/19/2018. Proceeding will define affordability criteria and ow to assess affordability impacts across utility services, and other	Workshop scheduled 1/2019 on affordability metrics.	In Progress	*Affordability Metrics Framework Staff Proposal introducing three affordability metrics was issued August 2019, with an updated version of the proposal consisting of refinements to the metrics scheduled to be issued January 2020.  *Staff Proposal recommends an Annual Affordability Report be prepared to present affordability assessments as well as other information related to utility service disconnections, arrearages and other metrics of observed hardship.  *Staff Proposal also recommends that the affordability metrics be tested in a proceeding, with the results to inform future work by staff, before full-scale roll-out	Energy Division, Water Division, and Communications Division staff is to collaborat on producing the first Annual Affordability Report and to test the affordability metrics in a ratesetting proceeding.

•A PD is scheduled to be issued May 2020.

impact.

of the use of the metrics by decision-makers during proceedings with ratepayer

issues. R.18-07-006

3.3	Perform lead testing in water for all schools within utility service territories to meet the requirements of AB 746	Water Division	Notices sent to IOUs on January 18, 2018, follow up notice will be sent in December 2018. Statute requires completion by 7/2019	Statute requires completion by 7/2019	Complete	CPUC-jurisdictional water utility companies completed testing by mid-year 2019. Less than 1% of schools were found exceeding limit. Offending fixtures were removed or replaced resulting in no schools exceeding limit.	N/A
3.4	Develop a pilot program/partnership between service provider and government agencies to streamline the enrollment process through data sharing mechanism to increase Lifeline participation, specifically with the Dept of Social Services CalFresh recipients	Communications Division	Status: R 11-03-013. Ongoing workshops commenced in 8/2018. Decision establishing framework for pilot programs approved December 14, 2018.	Stakeholder workshops/public meetings. Proposed Decision approving the first pilot program anticipated by 3/2019.	Complete	The iFoster Pilot, is a partnership among the CPUC, Boost Mobile, and iFoster, a Truckee-based non-profit that helps foster youth across the state navigate the public assistance programs available to them, among other methods of supporting foster youth. Using money provided by the CPUC (and discounts provided by Boost Mobile), iFoster is distributing free smartphones with at least 2 years of free calling, texting, and data services to up to 33,000 foster youth across the state.	N/A
3.5	Coordinate with CPUC Outreach office to develop and conduct outreach strategies in tribal areas (through tribal leaders) to increase federal enhanced Lifeline participation	Communications Division and News & Outreach Office	Ongoing monthly discussions/meetings between the two divisions; First meeting was in 7/2018.	Fully developed strategies and outreach conducted by 3/2019.	In Progress	NOO Tribal Liaison, in partnership with Communications Division, have conducted workshops and continue to outreach in Indian Country. There is now a dedicated Communication Division staff person (CD Tribal Advisor) to assist tribes with broadband access.	CD Tribal Advisor will continue working with Northern California tribes on broadband access.
3.6	Encourage service providers to utilize community-based organizations to conduct marketing and outreach activities to educate ESJ communities about the Lifeline program.	Communications Division	Ongoing workshops commenced in 8/2018. Decision 18-12-019 set forth a Lifeline Pilots Framework	Ongoing to complete action	Complete	Currently in operation are the CARE Pilot and the iFoster Pilot, both of which partner with Boost Mobile for phone service. The CARE Pilot allows all households enrolled in California Alternative Rates for Energy (CARE), an Energy Division program for low-income California households, to receive \$15/month off wireless phone service from Boost Mobile. To help administer this pilot, we have partnered with a Contact Center operated by CSU-Fresno's Office of Community and Economic Development, which is hiring up to 20 bilingual and trilingual employees in Fresno to help people across the state sign up for discounts in English, Spanish, Punjabi, and Hmong, via phone or email.	N/A
3.7	Evaluate data needs of Lifeline participants and discuss strategies to incentivize service providers to increase data plan offerings	Communications Division	Ongoing workshops commenced in 8/2018. Decision 18-12-019 set forth a Lifeline Pilots Framework	Ongoing to complete action	In Progress	California LifeLine Program has heard proposals for additional Pilot Programs from other interested parties regarding telehealth and streamlined enrollment for eligible recipients of public assistance. However, these interested parties have not yet filed formal proposals or participated in public workshops, so the CPUC has not yet assessed these proposals.	N/A
3.8	Host workshops to brainstorm new strategies to: 1) improve program enrollment for those eligible; 2) broaden array of service providers; 3) explore expanding available phone service plans and discounts; and 4) establish new options to streamline enrollment for lowincome households/ESJs	Communications Division	Ongoing workshops commenced in 8/2018. Decision 18-12-019 set forth a Lifeline Pilots Framework	Ongoing to complete action	In Progress	Workshopped three additional proposals for Pilot Programs. The first is a proposal by The Greenlining Institute to simplify online enrollment and renewals in California LifeLine, to lower the administrative burden faced by the CPUC and the Program's participants alike. The second is a proposal by TruConnect to provide free data to low-income households in need of telehealth services, such as video-chatting with doctors or remotely monitoring blood sugar levels, to improve healthcare outcomes and reduce the number of trips patients need to make. The third is a marketing and outreach proposal by the Central City SRO Collaborative, which operates affordable housing in San Francisco, to train and hire two of its residents to enroll their neighbors in California LifeLine and navigate its renewal process.	N/A
3.9	Launch partnerships with government-assistance programs to increase participation	Communications Division	Status: Ongoing discussions	Ongoing to complete action; Proposed Decision anticipated to be released in 2019			The Commission is also considering pending and new proposed pilots in the California LifeLine Program proceeding, which is Order Instituting Rulemaking 11-03-013.

3.10	_	Communications Division	Status: D.18-06-032 Three decisions were adopted in 2018 to implement the CASF: the Adoption Program Decision, the Consortia Decision, and the Infrastructure Program Decision.		In Progress	biannual application cycles. Communities with demonstrated low broadband access and/or low broadband subscription rates will be given preference, as well as low-income communities, senior communities, and communities facing socioeconomic barriers to broadband adoption. Applications may be submitted at any time. However, the CPUC will consider applications submitted on or before each deadline listed below as a batch, until all funds have been awarded. Publicly supported communities who are otherwise eligible to apply for grants from the Broadband Public Housing Account are also eligible to submit an application only after all funds available for adoption projects from the Public Housing Account have been awarded. From January 2018 through March 2019 50 additional grants were approved. These projects provided digital literacy training to 14,700 participants and broadband access to 85,600 participants.  2. Pursuant to Resolution T-17529, on March 6th, 2018, the CPUC's Communication Division hosted a Consortia Learning Summit to gather and exchange their-accomplishments in implementing action plans, share best practices, outstanding gaps/needs, and challenges faced in achieving common broadband deployment, access, and adoption goals: The CASF Rural and Urban Regional Broadband Consortia Grant Account is available for grants to eligible consortia to facilitate deployment of broadband services by assisting infrastructure applicants in the project development or grant application process. In 2018, the Consortia Account reimbursed over \$1,392 million for 17 consortia groups, representing 54 out of 58 California counties. Solicitation is closed for the 2019 Cycle.  3. The Line Extension Program (LEF) offers grants to offset the costs associated with connecting households to facilities-based providers, as required by Assembly Bill (AB) 1665. An "Eligible Applicant" is the customer residing at the location to be served. All recipients of the LEP grant must meet the income-based requirements.	CPUC will post the application descriptions submitted by the deadline on the CPUC's CASF webpage. Upcoming CASF Deadline Dates include: January 1, 2020, July 1, 2020, January 1, 2021, July 1, 2022. CD will consider applications for LEP submitted on or before each deadline until the funding is exhausted for the years 2020, 2021, and 2022: March 1, June 1, September 1, and December 1.
3.11	Commission proceedings and	Energy, Communications, and Water Divisions	Scoping Ruling issued 11/19/2018. Proceeding will define affordability criteria and how to assess affordability impacts across utility services, and other issues. R.18-07-006	Workshops scheduled 1/2019 on affordability metrics.	In Progress	• Affordability Metrics Framework Staff Proposal introducing three affordability metrics was issued August 2019, with an updated version of the proposal consisting of refinements to the metrics scheduled to be issued January 2020. • Staff Proposal recommends an Annual Affordability Report be prepared to present affordability assessments as well as other information related to utility service disconnections, arrearages and other metrics of observed hardship. • Staff Proposal also recommends that the affordability metrics be tested in a proceeding, with the results to inform future work by staff, before full-scale roll-out of the use of the metrics by decision-makers during proceedings with ratepayer impact. • A PD is scheduled to be issued May 2020.	Energy Division, Water Division, and Communications Division staff is to collaborate on producing the first Annual Affordability Report and to test the affordability metrics in a ratesetting proceeding.
3.12	Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) are not	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Approved in D 13-09- 045. Launched in 2014 and continued	Continue implementation in 2018-2019	In Progress	Reviewing and analyzing data, awaiting Commission action on issues related to confidentiality of data from TNCs.	Present analysis to Commission on availability of TNC service
3.13	and ESJ stakeholders to solicit input addressing the	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Approved in D 18-05- 043. Working group commenced in 11/2018	(Blank - No status listed in ESJ Plan)	In Progress	Public workshop held in October 2019 that included discussion on AV accessibility issues. Ruling issued in December 2019 that included requests for comments on accessibility	Continue to keep Accessibility Workgroup up to date on developments in the proceeding
3.14			First workshop held 12/2018. Proposed opening OIR pursuant to Phase III.C Scoping Memo dated 4/27/2018, issue 2.1 Accessibility	Order Instituting Rulemaking expected to commence in 2019	In Progress	CPUC will post the application descriptions submitted by the deadline on the CPUC's CASF webpage. Upcoming CASF Deadline Dates include: January 1, 2020, July 1, 2020, January 1, 2021, July 1, 2021, January 1, 2022, July 1, 2022. CD will consider applications for LEP submitted on or before each deadline until the funding is exhausted for the years 2020, 2021, and 2022: March 1, June 1, September 1, and December 1.	Implement administration of Access Fund program including training for TNCs on required documentation. Conduct a public workshop on program implementation and other access-related issues

Goal 4: Increase climate resiliency in ESJ communities.

				_			
4.1	Consider strategies and guidance for climate change adaptation, including identifying a goal to "Increase climate resiliency in low-income and disadvantaged communities"	Energy Division	R.18-04-019 issued. PHC held 8/6/18	CPUC will host a working group entitled Identification and prioritization of actions to address the climate change related needs of vulnerable and disadvantaged communities. This working group will begin meeting in Spring 2019.		"CPUC hosted two workshops devoted to identifying, contacting, and assisting vulnerable and disadvantaged communities with climate adaptation. The workshops were followed by an IOU published working group report that summarized parties' positions. The topic primarily focused on three questions: (1) What is an appropriate definition of vulnerable and disadvantaged communities in the context of climate adaptation? What are the special needs of these communities that should be addressed? (2) How should utilities and the Commission include these communities in their efforts to identify and prioritize climate adaptation investments? (3) How should investments and other activities benefitting these communities in the context of climate change impacts be identified and prioritized? "	Finalize decision to adopt a definition for vulnerable and disadvantaged community in a climate adaptation lens, as well as guidelines for how the IOUs incorporate those communities into climate adaptation to ensure a more equitable future.
4.2	Consider revisions to the IOUs' electric distribution undergrounding programs operating pursuant to Electric Tariff Rule 20, including explore options to enhance ESJ community participation in the Rule 20 undergrounding programs	Energy Division	R.17-05-010 issued. PHC held 9/11/17. Scoping Ruling released 11/9/18.	Parties will submit proposals for near-term improvements to Rule 20A program by 12/21/18. Program audits likely to begin by April 2019 and end by early 2020.	In progress	Staff held a workshop on April 22-23 focused on discussing near-term improvements to the Rule 20 program. PG&E Rule 20A program audit in compliance with D.18-03-022 was completed and revealed issues with PG&E's management of the Rule 20A program. The related R.17-05-010 Rule 20 program audits were put on hold, pending consideration of the staff proposal and party comments and to promote the efficient and fair resolution of the Rulemaking.	Staff is to issue a Staff Proposal in early 2020 in the Undergrounding OIR (R.17-05-010) for improving the Rule 20 program. Staff envisions a program redesign that will make disadvantaged communities eligible for higher levels of ratepayer subsidies for undergrounding projects under the Rule 20B Tariff.
Goal 5: En	hance outreach and public par	ticipation opportu		ities to meaningfully partici	pate in the C	PUC's decision-making process and benefit from CPUC programs.	
5.1	Initiated ESJ Action Plan to obtain early input from ESJ communities, Initial feedback sought on Action Plan from DAC AG	News & Outreach Office and Energy Division	Shared Plan with DAC AG and Low-Income Oversight Board, beginning in 8/2018. Held public webinar 11/2018.	Staff will continue to receive public feedback	Ongoing	Continuing to update Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group on ESJ Action Plan progress.	Will be providing updates to DACAG and LIOB in upcoming meetings, as well as presenting status updates at May 2020 Voting Meeting. Will invite ESJ stakeholders proactively to provide public comment about progress on ESJ Action Plan.
5.2	Create early engagement opportunities so that ESJ communities may learn about issues far in advance of the feedback requirements of proceedings	News & Outreach Office	New Proposal	Develop draft proposal by 3/ 2019. Proposal may include engagement ideas such as meetings, workshops, surveys, communications, etc.	Ongoing	NOO BCO conducted webinar to educate CBOs and local governments on how to become parties to proceedings. NOO BCO convenes weekly to look at new filings and determine which may be of interest to CBOs. NOO BCO then conduct proactive outreach to involve CBOs in those proceedings. NOO BCO also has started sending out monthly newsletters with additional opportunities to be involved at the CPUC.	Continue educating CBOs and local governments on how to become parties and participate in proceedings.
5.3	Make public internet interface friendlier to those entirely new to CPUC work/procedures	News & Outreach Office			In progress	Began website overhaul in Summer 2019. Project includes stakeholder engagement and a focus on creating a more consumer-friendly website. Draft templates made available for staff feedback in December 2019. Also working on improving internal website governance to ensure strong quality control.	Work will continue into 2020, with aim to launch in Fall 2020.
5.4	Improve quality of experience for communities in CPUC public hearings, voting meetings, and other events to promote meaningful participation. Including: Hold CPUC events in buildings that are easily accessible to public transportation and offer parking options; Provide translation services for limited English participants; Provide remote access options for all events; Hold meetings at convenient date, time and locations for communities	News & Outreach Office			In progress	Remote Access Report completed by NOO BCO staff in Summer of 2019, offering recommendations to improve access for stakeholders. Being implemented now. Most Voting Meetings now include sign language interpretation. NOO BCO Liaisons work with NOO PAO, ALI, and Commissioner Offices when scheduling events to provide recommendations for appropriate and accessible venues in local communities. Additionally, the Policy and Governance Committee is exploring ways to improve access to Commission activities. The Committee has presented draft updates to CPUC Rules of Practice and Procedure, some of which relate to improving remote access.	NOO and the Commission's Policy and Governance Committee will continue to improve options for remote access to meetings and events.

5.5	Coordinate between Local Government Liaisons, Commissioners' staff, and others to inform ESJ advocates and leaders, where appropriate, of public hearings, Voting Meetings, and events at which consumers in these communities can engage directly with the CPUC	News & Outreach Office			Ongoing	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Will work on improving planning and coordination for tours and meetings in advance of Off Site Voting Meetings.
5.6	Make CPUC communications available in multiple languages, as feasible including: CPUC Basics Primer; How to Participate in a Public Hearing/How to Make Public Comment	News & Outreach Office			In progress	NOO has increased capacity in graphic design and has begun overhauling all Fact Sheets and Brochures. Public Participation Brochures are prioritized. Content will be streamlined and made more accessible, and then translated.	Complete Public Participation Brochure series by mid-2020. Move forward to revise and translate key Consumer Program Brochures. Develop policy for creation of materials in the future, including guidelines on reading level. Also look into Google Translate option on CPUC website to understand quality.
5.7	Create a list of community groups in ESJs for outreach to appropriate groups about CPUC proceedings and programs	News & Outreach Office			In progress	CBO list has been created in Constant Contact. NOO BCO Liaisons also maintain local lists and prepare monthly newsletters and direct email communication to disseminate information.	Develop process for utilizing CBO list in Constant Contact.
5.8	Develop or update outreach materials to support ESJ outreach	News & Outreach Office			In progress	Completed a brochure for DAC-specific programs and opportunities. NOO as increased capacity in graphic design and has begun overhauling all Fact Sheets and Brochures. Public Participation Brochures are prioritized. Content will be streamlined and made more accessible, and then translated.	Complete Public Participation Brochure series by mid-2020. Move forward to revise and translate key Consumer Program Brochures. Develop policy for creation of materials in the future, including guidelines on reading level.
5.9	Explore non-traditional means for communication with ESJ communities	News & Outreach Office	Work in progress	Research communication options and survey ESJ community for feedback; Final recommendations by 4/2019.		Increased NOO staffing capacity to focus on ESJ issues. In partnership with NOO BCO Liaisons, have been conducting more outreach to ESJ groups and organizing tours and meetings of local communities prior to Off-Site Voting Meetings.	Continue to explore additional outreach avenues, including finding speaking engagements for Commissioners at key ESJ events and organizations.
5.10	Seek additional resources to dedicate to ESJ outreach and engagement	News & Outreach Office			In progress	Additional staff now hired in NOO to focus on DAC and ESJ stakeholders and issues.	Explore opportunities to support CBO involvement in CPUC processes outside of Intervener Compensation.
5.11	Utilize input from DAC AG to inform current/future CPUC clean energy programs to identify potential ESJ implications and add new or modified program elements for outreach gaps	Energy Division	DAC AG began regular meetings in 4/2018. It has provided input to this Action Plan	CPUC staff will support the DAC AG with foundational information on CPUC processes and programs. DAC AG will provide advice to the CPUC and California Energy Commission on clean energy programs and their existing and potential benefits/impacts to DACs	In progress	In coordination with CEC, provided weekly updates to the DACAG on CPUC related meetings, workshops, and comment periods related to their 11 priority areas. CPUC and CEC staff organized 10 public DACAG meetings.	In the development of the agenda and in the facilitation of DACAG meetings, Identify opportunities for the DACAG to provide meaningful input to CPUC clean energy programs.
5.12	Initiate targeted outreach to DAC communities for input on project design by EPIC administrators	Energy Division	D.18-10-052 approved 10-25-2018	Administrators (California Energy Commission and utilities) will provide training about EPIC to DACs and interested community-based organizations. In preparing workshops, Administrators will engage with the DAC Advisory Group.	In progress	The IOUs and CEC engaged in targeted outreach to DAC communities for input into the EPIC program.	CPUC and EPIC administrators are actively seeking ways to improve DAC input into the EPIC program. In particular, they are exploring ways to ensure more meaningful DAC engagement with EPIC projects at all stages of development.

5.13	Support outreach to community groups via the Energy Upgrade California campaign to educate customers on the roll-out of Time-of-Use rates in DACs so that customers understand how to shift electric usage	Energy Division	Underway D.17-12-023	CPUC provides funding to inform communities about change in rates, including for media and community based organization engagement	lin nrograce	CPUC provides funding to inform communities about change in rates, including for media and community based organization engagement.	PD underway to renew funds for 2020 EUC TOU campaign.
5.14	Develop methods and processes to assess affordability across Commission proceedings and services	Energy, Communications, and Water Divisions	Scoping Ruling issued 11/19/2018. Proceeding will define affordability criteria and how to assess affordability impacts across utility services and other issues. R.18-07-006	Workshop scheduled 1/2019 on affordability metrics.		•Affordability Metrics Framework Staff Proposal introducing three affordability metrics was issued August 2019, with an updated version of the proposal consisting of refinements to the metrics scheduled to be issued January 2020.  *Staff Proposal recommends an Annual Affordability Report be prepared to present affordability assessments as well as other information related to utility service disconnections, arrearages and other metrics of observed hardship.  *Staff Proposal also recommends that the affordability metrics be tested in a proceeding, with the results to inform future work by staff, before full-scale roll-out of the use of the metrics by decision-makers during proceedings with ratepayer impact.	Energy Division, Water Division, and Communications Division staff is to collaborate on producing the first Annual Affordability Report and to test the affordability metrics in a ratesetting proceeding. A PD is scheduled to be issued May 2020.
5.15	Reduce incidents of energy utility disconnections	Energy Division	Decision 18-12-013 on interim relief adopted. Three workshops held in vulnerable communities to address targets and other program proposals.	Complete workshop report by 3/2019. Propose new targets and policies by 7/2019.	In progress	"• Ruling questions were issued by ALJ in May, June, and November 2019 to solicit parties' input on the 2024 target, existing program changes, pilot proposals, deposit, uncollectibles, and other issues. • Three workshops on disconnection targets, program changes and proposals, and vulnerable populations held in communities with high disconnections. • Energy Division submitted a legislative report in April 2019, the first workshop report and a statistical analysis in June 2019, and the second workshop report in September 2019."	"• A proposed decision for Phase 1 will be issued in early 2020. • Phase 1-A will address disconnections in SMJU territories. • Phase II will take a broader look at the disconnection process and consider innovative solutions."
5.16	Utilities will strive to increase Family Electric Rate Assistance (FERA) Status: D. 18-08-013 (PG&E) and D.18-10-012 (SCE) direct IOUs to take steps to increase FERA enrollment to 50% of those eligible. PG&E held workshop in 2018 and submitted its plan in 10/2018	Energy Division		submits progress report on an annual basis, beginning	In progress	The IOUs continue to work to increase FERA penetration pursuant to D.18-08-013 and D.18-11-027. The IOUs also have requested to transition the FERA program from their respective General Rate Cases (GRCs) to the consolidated low income proceeding A. 19-11-003 addressing applications for program years 2021-2026. The budget applications were filed on November 4th, 2019 and include funding requests for administrative and subsidy costs to support the FERA program.	"The IOU consolidated application proceeding is currently underway with a final decision anticipated in late 2020. This decision will determine whether FERA is transitioned into the low income docket. The IOUs will continue to submit annual reports demonstrating their progress toward achieving penetration goals."

Goal 6: Enhance enforcement to ensure safety and consumer protection for ESJ communities.

6.1	1 ' '	News & Outreach Office	Commission issues Resolution T-17596 in May 2018, adopting the settlement agreement between CPED and Budget Prepaid, under which Budget Prepaid will refund \$1,117,730 to the California Lifeline Fund.	Currently investigating providers for alleged improper Lifeline subscriber registrations and subsidy collections. Continue reviewing complaint data from various sources for evidence of improper collection of carrier charges. Initiate enforcement action accordingly. Query and analyze informal contact data from consumers regarding Lifeline Billing issues and provide to Communications	Ongoing	The Consumer Affairs Branch (CAB), which regularly assists Lifeline customers with subscription challenges, is in regular coordination with Communications Division and the Lifeline contractor Maximus. Meetings are held on a consistent basis to share information and discuss issues.	Coordination is ongoing.
				Division and Utilities Enforcement Branch to determine policy changes and enforcement actions, if needed.  Query and analyze informal contact data from consumers regarding public purpose			
6.2	Process consumer complaints, including those from ESJ communities, regarding public purpose programs such as California Lifeline and CARE	News & Outreach Office	Ongoing	programs and provide to Communications Division, Energy Division, and Utilities Enforcement Branch to determine policy changes and enforcement actions, if needed.	Ongoing	Consumer Affairs Branch (CAB) continues to take phone calls and assisting customers with low-income programs. Data is reported in monthly reports and posted on the CPUC website: https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/General.aspx?id=5400 Reports specific to Lifeline are also compiled and reported on the CPUC website: https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/ccd_lifeline/	Work is ongoing.
	providers to ensure proper	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Ongoing	Continue monitoring consumer complaints and initiate enforcement action accordingly; Undertake testing of prepaid phone cards in market to ensure compliance with disclosure requirements of PU Code § 885 et. seq. Query and analyze informal contact data from consumers regarding public purpose programs and provide to Divisions to determine policy changes and enforcement actions, if needed	Ongoing	Continue to monitor complaints and initiate enforcement actions as needed, including testing of cards to ensure PU Code compliance.	Continue to monitor.
6.4	regarding allegations of redlining or unequal passenger	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Ongoing	Continues in 2019-2020	Ongoing	TEB received no complaints of redlining in 2019.	Continue to monitor complaints and initiate enforcement actions as needed.

6.5	Provide statistics on consumer complaints to Commission stakeholders regarding public purpose programs that may inform utility policymaking for ESJ communities	News & Outreach Office	Ongoing	Prepare a report on informal contact data from consumers regarding public purpose programs.	Ongoing	Reports are prepared on a monthly basis and posted on CAB webpage. Statistics are also summarized in a monthly recap sent to Commissioners and Directors. CAB also tracks and posts specific information related to complaints from customers with Limited English Proficiency: https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/ccd_lep/	Work is ongoing.
6.6	Ensure that inspectors continue to maintain a database of active pay phones and routinely inspect them for both safety and functionality for service to ESJ communities	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Inspected over 5,000 payphones in 2018 for operability, signage, and safety.	Assess existing pay phone database to evaluate its performance; Update mapping of payphone locations in CA; Establish formalized risk-based inspection program	Complete	Inspected 3,122 payphones in 2019 for operability, signage, and safety. Audited the payphone database and updated the geographic map of payphone locations in the state. Requested payphone providers post the Commission's contact information on their payphones to assist consumers who wish to file complaints.	N/A
6.7	Examine prepaid phone card providers' license applications to determine whether CPED should intervene in the application review process to raise issues of capability and fitness.	Protection & Enforcement	Ongoing. Reviewed 28 provider license applications in 2018.	Continue to monitor Commission daily calendar for license applications, review for fitness, and protest accordingly	Ongoing	Reviewed 19 license applications in 2019 and recommended 3 for non-approval to Communications Division.	Continue to monitor Commission daily calendar for license applications, review for fitness and protest accordingly.
6.8	Examine license applications from passenger carriers to determine whether the applicant qualifies to provide intrastate services	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Ongoing	Continues in 2019-2020	Ongoing	Before approving transportation licensing applications in 2019, transportation analysts reviewed carrier applications to ensure carriers' rides originate and end in California (intrastate).	This review for intrastate qualification will continue in 2020.
6.9	Conduct surprise bus inspections, including those at the CA-US border, and ensure that bus companies obtain and maintain CPUC license requirements, including all safety and registration standards	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	Ongoing	Continues in 2019-2020	Ongoing	Conducted 31 surprise vehicle inspections in 2019 at tourist and popular locations in California.	Continues in 2020.
6.10	Implement SB 656: consumer protections for core gas customers who may buy natural gas through Core Transport Agents	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	D 18-02-002 issued in 2/2018 adopted registration requirements and consumer protection rules. Resolution UEB-003 issues in 10/2018 adopted citation program for enforcing compliance with the standards for verification of change in provider requirements.	Develop informational guides and webpages, updates to the informal and formal complaint forms and processes; Explore development of a 'Do Not Call List' database for core customers who do not want to be contacted by any gas marketers; Review complaint data from various sources to identify wrongdoing, investigate, and issue citations. Core Transport Agents informal contact data sharing on a monthly basis began in January 2018; Enforce registration requirements for Core Transport Agents and pursue suspension and revocation if warranted.	Complete	Reviewed 428 CTA-related unauthorized enrollment complaints received by the Commission in 2019 to enforce compliance with the standards for verification of change in provider requirements in D. 18-02-002, and to identify acts constituting grounds for suspension or revocation of registration pursuant to PU Code Section 983.5. Issued 5 CTA citations and 87 data requests.	N/A

6.11	Develop residential rooftop solar consumer protection measures	Consumer Protection & Enforcement Division	D.18-09-044 adopted Net Energy Metering (NEM) consumer protection measures including process for creating solar information packet. Amended Scoping Memo in R.14-07-002, issued 12/21/2018 Workshop in Huron, CA identifying egregious residential rooftop solar consumer complaints.	Interagency task force established to address solar consumer complaints; Issue draft solar information packet to R.14-07-002 listserv by 2/2/1019; Host workshop on draft solar information packet by /4/2019.	Complete	On 10/18/2019 the ACR proposed additional consumer protection methods to protect solar consumers such as a registration process for solar providers and a citation enforcement program. On 01/02/2020 a PD was issued adopting esignatures for info packet and directing CPED to develop a citation program. On 2/6/2020 the Decision was adopted to implement esignatures and direct CPED to propose a citation program for all the enhanced consumer protection methods within 90-days of the Decision.	N/A.
6.12	Upgrade electric and gas distribution systems in mobile home parks (MHPs) to improve resident safety, service reliability, and improve standard of living by increasing electric supply capacity.	Safety & Enforcement Division	Pilot program prioritizing safety began in 2015 (D. 14- 03-021). Two Technical working group meetings and a workshop were held to discuss data needs.	The Commission will evaluate data to determine whether program converting MHPs to direct utility service will continue	In progress	The Mobilehome Park Pilot (MHP Pilot) incentivized mobilehome parks and manufactures housing communities with master-metered natural gas and electricity to transfer to direct utility service. As of 2018, 44% of all converted parks were in DACs.	Proposed Decision in March 2020 extends the program beyond 2021 with the goal of converting up to 50% of master-metered mobilehome parks to direct utility service by 2030. DAC status will be included as a factor in prioritization of these conversions.
Caal 7: Du	omote economic and workford						
7.1	CPUC has held annual Supplier Diversity en banc since 2002 in order to encourage IOUs to attain a voluntary goal of 30% diversity	News & Outreach Office	portunities in ESJ com	munities.	In progress	Annual Supplier Diversity En Banc was held in Fresno in Fall 2019, for the first time in the San Joaquin Valley. Program was expanded to incorporate CCAs and energy entities, greatly increasing the number of firms needing to participate in GO 156.	Outreach to CCAs to bring them into the program is underway. Will also set targets for LGBT businesses for the first time in 2020.
7.2	Develop a white paper exploring new issues on supplier diversity to help inform California Legislature and local governments	News & Outreach Office			In progress	NOO BCO staff has begun initial research and White Paper topics have been proposed and assessed. White Paper Work Plan has been established.	Draft of White Paper will tentatively be completed in 2020.
7.3	Expand opportunities for diverse workforce in utility energy efficiency program implementation	Energy Division	D.18-10-008 defines "disadvantaged workers," requires IOUs to determine how they will provide increased access to employment for disadvantaged workers, and establishes goals to track disadvantaged	IOUs include approved terms and conditions in soliciting bids and establishing contracts. In 2019 annual budget filings, IOUs will propose a portfolio level indicator to track disadvantaged worker participation	In progress	IOUs successfully included a portfolio level indicator to track disadvantaged workers in budget filings.	Third party solicitation process continues, first contracts will be signed and programs will begin. Expecting first round of metrics on these programs at the end of the following reporting year.

programs

7.4	Encourage the SOMAH Program Administrator to develop and implement strategies to encourage local hiring by participating contractors	Energy Division	D.17-12-022. Work in progress: SOMAH PA has submitted a workforce training proposal	CPUC seeks to adopt a compliant workforce plan for the SOMAH program by 6/2019.	In progress	As of November 2019, 249 out of 253 SOMAH applications were submitted by just seven contractors, with no more than four contractors in any given utility territory. These contractors were those most attuned to regulatory and prelaunch program developments or those with experience navigating similar programs, allowing them to apply soon after program launch. To more holistically address the suite of training needs and opportunities geared toward strengthening California's solar workforce, the SOMAH PA's partnership with the Rising Sun Center for Opportunity will produce resources that will empower contractors to provide safe job training opportunities to local and targeted hires, including people of color and of low income, returning citizens, residents of multifamily affordable housing, women, veterans and other priority populations in line with emerging and best practices. These efforts also will also support career attainment and growth and ensure program design and requirements are responsive to longer-term needs of California's solar industry.	To support greater workforce development impacts in 2020 and beyond, the SOMAH PA will launch a Job Training Organization (JTO) Task Force in 2020 with		
7.5	Collaborate with relevant state agencies to consider executing a Memorandum of Understanding to promote a trained and ready workforce in clean energy	Energy Division	New action	Meet with agencies to identify areas for collaboration, draft, and adopt a Memorandum of Understanding.	In progress	CPUC staff met with California Workforce Development Board staff three times in 2019 to understand the expertise of each agency and brainstorm ways the agencies could support one another to improve workforce development in energy programs under the CPUC's jurisdiction. CPUC staff shared current workforce development efforts that are part of the utility energy efficiency programs to help the Workforce Development Board understand the scope of some current CPUC efforts	Continue working toward execution of a Memorandum of Understanding with the California Workforce Development Board		
Goal 8: Imi	oal 8: Improve training and staff development related to ESJ issues within the CPUC's jurisdiction.								
8.1	Create required, interdivisional training to exchange information and develop knowledge base	Cross-Divisional	New Proposal	Convene working group in coordination with Commissioner offices to develop scope of training including learning objectives, goals and training requirements for implementation by June 2019. Assess how to integrate ESJ Action Plan goals and objectives into existing onboarding training for new employees by December 2019	In progress	As part of ESJ Action Plan implementation, a working group has been established of ESJ Liaisons across all CPUC Divisions. Actively discussing what kind of information sharing and training needs exist for staff.	Initial training concepts for staff include: 1) Community Outreach and Engagement; 2) Meeting Facilitation; 3) Implicit Bias; and 4) Cal Enviro Screen. Cal Enviro Screen training to be held in Spring 2020.		
8.2	Send staff to Government Alliance on Race & Equity (GARE), or other trainings to learn about ESJ communities, including how to directly engage with them.	Cross-Divisional	New Proposal	Assess current training and professional development opportunities and programs to determine need for additional training to support ESJ Action Plan by December 2019. Develop implementation plan if additional training is deemed appropriate and budget is secured in 2019- 2020.	In progress	CPUC has committed to being involved in the upcoming state agency cohort. HR has been working to develop the program and recruit cohort from across the organization.	Cohort will begin training in the Fall of 2020.		

8.3	Coordinate with other state agencies to build internal knowledge and capacity on ESJ issues. Create regular processes and tools to build and exchange knowledge.	News & Outreach Office and Energy Division	Coordinating with Energy Commission in support of the DAC Advisory Group and implementation of PU Code 400(g). CPUC participates in interagency activities, such as the Barriers Studies' Interagency Task Force	Continue to work with Energy Commission to support DACAG. Continue inter- agency coordination on ESJ issues as they arise.	Ongoing	DACAG Coordination continues. CPUC also worked with CalEPA, State Lands Commission, Dept of Toxic Substances and Control, and the Dept of Public Health to design a Community Outreach and Engagement training. Over 20 CPUC staff attended.	Will bring Community Engagement and Outreach training to CPUC staff and pursue opportunities for other state agencies to deliver training to staff on ESJ-related issues.
Cool O. Ma	onitor the CPUC's ESJ efforts to	avaluata have the	v ara achieving their	phiasticas			
9.1	Identify quantitative and/or qualitative baselines, targets, and timelines that could most likely indicate program participation levels in ESJ Communities	Cross-Divisional	New Proposal	Identify which CPUC programs should be tracked.	In progress	Programs continue to track program participation and metrics on an individual basis.	Pursue opportunities to aggregate information across industry areas and the Commission, and consider doing geographic spatial analysis to understand if ESJ communities are appropriately benefitting from Commission program. Use data to inform program outreach.
9.2	Identify quantitative and/or qualitative baselines, targets, and timelines for measuring the effectiveness of marketing, outreach, with the goal of determining best practices for communicating to underrepresented customer groups while also reaching the "right" groups for the particular issue or proceeding	News &Outreach Office			In progress	NOO continues to track number of comments received for proceedings, attendance at Public Participation Hearings, emails and phone calls to CBOs, and social media engagement. Report on a monthly basis to Commissioners and Directors. New Public Comment feature on Docket Card likely to be most promising opportunity.	Consider opportunities for cross-office policy and processes for more consistent data collection to document change over time.
9.3	Schedule annual reporting on effectiveness of ESJ metrics and tracking	News & Outreach Office	New Proposal	Identify schedule and format of reporting	In progress	Will provide full status update to Commissioners and public at May 2020 Voting Meeting.	Will also brief DACAG and LIOB on progress.
9.4	Every 3 years evaluate both the SOMAH program and its administrator to review performance, costs, units served, location of properties, customer (and tenant) satisfaction, job training, and job creation, using an independent evaluator	Energy Division	Approved in D.17-12- 022	In 2019, Energy Division will work with SDG&E (on behalf of all IOUs) to determine the scope of work for a statewide process evaluation and issue a Request for Proposals to hire an independent consultant. Deliver a final report by 6/2020	In progress	"After a competitive solicitation process, Energy Division selected Itron and ILLUME to conduct a process and load impact evaluation. The evaluation is planned in two phases - with the first phase geared to develop a program theory and logic model and a process flow analysis. The second phase, seeks to provide more traditional process evaluation that aims to document:  or or or or program Participation and Spending Assessment  or o	The evaluation team aims to complete phase one by Q2 2020 and phase two by Q1 2021. Data collection, analysis, surveying and in-depth interviews are scheduled to occur in 2020.
9.5	Complete a comprehensive evaluation of the CSI Thermal program to determine cost effectiveness and effectiveness in achieving program goals	Energy Division	Performance, technical, and cost effectiveness evaluations are in process and will be issued by December 2019	Awaiting drafts of the performance and technical evaluations. Contractor will begin work on the cost-effectiveness evaluation by 3/2019	Complete	Performance evaluation complete. Technical evaluation and cost-effectiveness study pending ED management review. CSI Thermal program sunsets on July 31, 2020. No further program evaluations are planned.	N/A

9.6	Identify metrics that would serve as proxies for energy program-related health outcomes in applicable programs (e.g. general health/comfort before and after installation)	Energy Division	D.17-12-009	Energy Savings Assistance nonenergy benefit study, including participant health costs and benefits, anticipated to be complete in March 2019. Next low-income program cycle will utilize report outcomes.	In progress	Residential Low-Income Non-Energy Benefits study completed in August, 2019. Results were used in IOU applications for ESA program years 2021-2026, specifically when calculating ESA cost-effectiveness and proposing household-level goals for non energy benefits. Additional updates to the non-energy benefits calculator will continue into 2020.	IOUs proposed a budget of \$500,000 in their ESA/CARE applications to conduct primary data collection on non-energy benefits during the next ESA program cycle of 2021-2026. Additionally, IOUs proposed goals for 2021-2026 ESA program years that would capture non-energy benefits accrued at household level. The proposed research and goals are being reviewed by the Commission now, and will be voted on as part of the application review process.
9.7	Report on the relative success of strategies to understand program outcomes and best practices for maximizing energy efficiency in DACs	Energy Division	Approved in D.18- 05041	Include assessments in annual reports, commencing 5/2019.	In progress	"All four IOUs included assessments of program outcomes in DACs within their 2018 annual reports (posted May, 2019). This included providing metrics related to maximizing energy efficiency in DACs, such as Percent of total Workforce, Education and Training program participants that meet the definition of a disadvantaged worker. Additionally, the IOUs began tracking energy savings from measures installed in DACs."	"Continue to track and report on metrics for DACs for PY 2019 and 2020 annual EE reports. As the contracts with third parties as part of the EE solicitation process begin to occur, IOUs will assess and report on the relative success of third-party implementers' strategies in disadvantaged communities. "
9.8	Quantify non-energy and local economic benefits of the environmental efficiency Local Government Partnerships in hard-to-reach and disadvantaged communities.	Energy Division	D.18-05-041 required the IOUs file a motion proposing how to quantify these benefits. The motion was filed on August 31, 2018.	D.19-08-006, which was a decision on LGP Terms & Conditions adopted the IOUs motion with modifications including direction on how to quantify non-energy benefits and local economic benefits for LGPs.	In progress	PG&E has hired a consultant Evergreen Economics to conduct a study to quantify co- benefits and local economic benefits of local government partnerships (LGPs) in hard to-reach (HTR) and disadvantaged communities (DAC) for the California investor- owned utilities (IOUs).	
9.9	Report to Legislature on strategies for maximizing electricity energy efficiency savings in Disadvantaged Communities	Energy Division	In statute- PU Code 454.55(a)(2)	Commencing in July 2019, and every four years thereafter.	Ongoing	On July 1, 2019 the CPUC submitted a report to the legislature and Governor. This report complies with Assembly Bill 1330 (Bloom. Statues 2015-2016) and addresses the progress toward achieving cost-effective electricity and natural gas efficiency savings for Investor Owned Utilities and Small-Multi Jurisdictional Utilities based on the established efficiency goals set by the CPUC. In addition, the report describes the specific strategies the CPUC is currently working on to maximize the contribution of electricity and natural gas efficiency savings in disadvantaged communities.	"-The EE program years 2017-2018 are currently being evaluated and will be updated soon San Joaquin Valley Proceeding-The CPUC is currently working on phase II track B in order to assess the scope, feasibility, and cost-effectiveness of the eleven pilots ESA Program: The investor-owned utilities submitted applications for the ESA program to the Commission in November 2019 for the program years of 2021 to 2026. Currently, there is an open proceeding to consider the applications, specifically focused on setting new goals for these programs and encouraging innovative program design to provide deeper energy savings as well as health, comfort and safety to low-income households."
9.10	Report to Legislature on strategies for maximizing natural gas energy efficiency savings in Disadvantaged Communities.	Energy Division	In statute- PU Code 454.56(d)	Commencing in July 2019, and every four years thereafter.	Ongoing	On July 1, 2019 the CPUC submitted a report to the legislature and Governor. This report complies with Assembly Bill 1330 (Bloom. Statues 2015-2016) and addresses the progress toward achieving cost-effective electricity and natural gas efficiency savings for Investor Owned Utilities and Small-Multi Jurisdictional Utilities based on the established efficiency goals set by the CPUC. In addition, the report describes the specific strategies the CPUC is currently working on to maximize the contribution of electricity and natural gas efficiency savings in disadvantaged communities.	"- The EE program years 2017-2018 are currently being evaluated and will be updated soon San Joaquin Valley Proceeding-The CPUC is currently working on phase II track B in order to assess the scope, feasibility, and cost-effectiveness of the eleven pilots ESA Program: The investor-owned utilities submitted applications for the ESA program to the Commission in November 2019 for the program years of 2021 to 2026. Currently, there is an open proceeding to consider the applications, specifically focused on setting new goals for these programs and encouraging innovative program design to provide deeper energy savings as well as health, comfort and safety to low-income households."
9.11	Compliance filings for business plan metrics will include metrics and targets for capturing energy savings in DACs and for hard-to- reach (HTR) customers	Energy Division	Approved in D.18- 05041	Commencing in September 2019.	Ongoing	All EE program administrators have metrics and targets for capturing energy savings in DACs and for HTR customers	ESA Program: The investor-owned utilities submitted applications for the ESA program to the Commission in November 2019 for the program years
9.12	Quantify co-benefits and local economic benefits of the environmental efficiency Local Government Programs in hard- to-reach and DACs	Energy Division	Approved in D.18-05- 041 and further guidance on issue was adopted in D.19-08-006 on the process.	There was no activity in 2018.	In progress	PG&E has hired consultant Evergreen Economics to conduct a study to quantify co- benefits and local economic benefits of local government partnerships in hard-to- reach customers and DACs for the IOUs.	Evergreen Economics will produce a report to quantify co-benefits and local economic benefits of local government partnerships (expected January 2021). The IOUs must then file a Tier 2 Advice Letter to update the modifiable terms in Attachment B of D.19-08-006, which will attempt to include a standardized methodology for measuring co-benefits and economic development benefits applicable to local government partnerships.